



Skenè Studies II • 7

Shakespeare 1 • Serpieri Lectures 1

Sonia Massai

**‘The Operation of
Individual Judgement’:
in Praise of Critical Editing**

visualizza la scheda del libro sul sito www.edizioniets.com



Edizioni ETS

S K E N È Texts and Studies - Studies II
Shakespeare. Serpieri Lectures

<i>Executive Editor</i>	Guido Avezzù.
<i>General Editors</i>	Guido Avezzù, Silvia Bigliazzi.
<i>Series Editors</i>	Silvia Bigliazzi, Fernando Cioni, Rocco Coronato, Keir Elam.
<i>Editorial Board</i>	Petra Bjelica, Sidia Fiorato, Cristiano Ragni, Emanuel Stelzer, Carla Suthren.
<i>Managing Editors</i>	Valentina Adami, Cristiano Ragni.
<i>Assistant Managing Editors</i>	Marco Duranti, Roberta Zanoni.
<i>Editorial Staff</i>	Chiara Battisti, Francesco Dall'Olio, Serena Demichelis, Carina Fernandes, Beatrice Righetti.
<i>Typesetting</i>	Cristiano Ragni.
<i>Advisory Board</i>	Zorica Bečanović Nikolić, Tom Bishop, Colin Burrow, Kent Cartwright, William B. Carroll, Rosy Colombo, Kevin Curran, Michael Dobson, Paul Edmondson, Ewan Fernie, Stephen Greenblatt, Andrew Hadfield, Peter Holland, Isabel Karremann, Gordon MacMullan, Virginia Mason Vaughan, Sonia Massai, Robert S. Miola, Stephen Orgel, Will Sharpe, Jesús Tronch Pérez, Stanley Wells, Deanne Williams.

SKENÈ. Texts and Studies (<https://textsandstudies.skeneproject.it/index.php/TS>)

Supplement to *SKENÈ. Journal of Theatre and Drama Studies*

Copyright © May 2024 S K E N È. Texts and Studies

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.
info@skeneproject.it

Edizioni ETS

Palazzo Roncioni - Lungarno Mediceo, 16, I-56127 Pisa

info@edizioniets.com

www.edizioniets.com

Distribuzione

Messaggerie Libri SPA

Sede legale: via G. Verdi 8 - 20090 Assago (MI)

Promozione

PDE PROMOZIONE SRL

via Zago 2/2 - 40128 Bologna

ISBN (pdf) 978-884676838-4

ISBN 978-884676839-1

ISSN 2421-4353

SKENÈ SHAKESPEARE

The *Skenè. Shakespeare* series combines the strengths of text-oriented criticism and close reading with state-of-the-art critical theory/theories. It offers longer studies (*Skenè. Shakespeare Series I*), shorter monographs (*Skenè. Shakespeare Studies II*) as well as editions of Shakespearean or Shakespeare-related texts (*Skenè. Shakespeare Texts*), presenting fully annotated scholarly editions with contextual materials as well as the performance history of each text. It also includes the *Serpieri Lectures*.

SERPIERI LECTURES

The *Serpieri Lectures* series collects the lectures held annually at Verona University in memory of Alessandro Serpieri as a tribute to his groundbreaking contributions to the fields of English Studies, Theory of Literature and Translation.

Contents

SONIA MASSAI	
‘The Operation of Individual Judgement’: in Praise of Critical Editing	9
PROLOGUE	11
PART 1	
The Place of ‘Individual Judgement’ in Contemporary Editorial Theory	13
PART 2	
‘Critical Editing’ as Practice	25
PART 3	
Seven Types of (Textual) Ambiguity	51
WORKS CITED	59
CARLA SUTHREN	
Afterword: the Editor as Translator	61
SILVIA BIGLIAZZI, FERNANDO CIONI, AND ROCCO CORONATO	
Appendix	85
Index	111

SONIA MASSAI

**‘The Operation of Individual Judgement’:
in Praise of Critical Editing**

PROLOGUE

The topic of the inaugural ‘Alessandro Serpieri Lecture’ from which this essay developed – what ‘critical editing’ means and how it affects current editorial practice – reflects areas of research interest that defined this scholar’s lifework and that intersect with my own, both as a Shakespeare textual editor and as a literary critic. I was therefore delighted to be asked to open this lecture series and to have the opportunity to pay homage to the legacy of Serpieri’s scholarship. Although I was not taught by Serpieri, his influence on my appreciation of what pertains to the study of early modern (dramatic) literature has been important and pervasive: Part 3 of this essay gives a representative example of how my work towards a new Arden edition of *Richard III*, briefly discussed in Parts 1 and 2, aligns in significant and serendipitous ways with how Serpieri understood the evocative quality and semantic instability of Shakespeare’s language.

Skenè. Texts and Studies

Founded in 2014 by Guido Avezzi, Silvia Bigliuzzi, and Alessandro Serpieri as a supplement to *Skenè. JTDS, Skenè. Texts and Studies, Skenè. Texts and Studies* is a peer-reviewed online and print-on-demand series of volumes including annotated editions of drama texts and primary sources as well as critical studies on the theory, practice, and history of theatre and drama. The series also aims at furthering original research by producing texts hitherto unpublished.

Texts: scholarly and annotated editions:

1. Maria Serena Marchesi, *5 November 1866: The Story of Henry Irving and Dion Boucicault's Hunted Down, or, The Two Lives of Mary Leigh*, 2016 (pp. 158)
2. Ulrich von Wilamowitz-Moellendorff, *Was ist eine attische Tragödie? What is an Attic Tragedy?*, Introduction and Notes by Gherardo Ugolini, Translation by Lisanna Calvi and Stefan Rabanus, 2016 (pp. 266)
3. Silvia Bigliuzzi, *Julius Caesar 1935: Shakespeare and Censorship in Fascist Italy*, 2019 (pp. 406)
4. Emanuel Stelzer, *Shakespeare Among Italian Criminologists and Psychiatrists, 1870s-1920s*, 2021 (pp. 238)
5. Marco Duranti, *"Ecclesiae et Rei Publicae": Greek Drama and the Education of the Ruling Class in Elizabethan England*, 2022 (pp. 148)

Texts DA: texts also published in digital archives:

1. Fabio Ciambella, ed. *War Discourse in Four Paradoxes: the Case of Thomas Scott (1602) and the Digges (1604)*, 2022 (pp. 226)
2. Marco Duranti and Emanuel Stelzer. eds. *A Feast of Strange Opinions: Classical and Early Modern Paradoxes on the English Renaissance Stage*
• 1.1, 2022 (pp. 279)
3. Marco Duranti and Emanuel Stelzer. eds. *A Feast of Strange Opinions:*

Classical and Early Modern Paradoxes on the English Renaissance Stage
 • 1.2, 2023 (pp. 284)

Studies I: original book-length studies:

1. Silvia Bigliuzzi, Francesco Lupi, Gherardo Ugolini, eds. *Συναγωνίζεσθαι: Studies in Honour of Guido Avezzi*, 2018 (pp. 1089)
2. Silvia Bigliuzzi, ed. *Oedipus at Colonus and King Lear: Classical and Early Modern Intersections*, 2019 (pp. 450)
3. Silvia Bigliuzzi and Emanuel Stelzer, eds. *Shakespeare and the Mediterranean • 1: Romeo and Juliet*, 2022 (pp. 296)
4. Fabio Ciambella, ed. *Shakespeare and the Mediterranean • 2: The Tempest*, 2023 (pp. 200)

Studies II: shorter publications:

1. Andrew L. Brown, *The Length of the Prologue of Aeschylus's Choephoroi*, 2015 (pp. 101)
2. Alessandro Serpieri, *Shakespeare's Drama in Poetry*, 2018² (pp. 201)
3. David Schalkwyk, *Words in the World: The Bakhtin Circle*, 2016 (pp. 127)
4. Giovanna di Martino, *Translating and Adapting Aeschylus' Seven Against Thebes in America*, 2020 (pp. 184)
5. Alessandro Grilli and Francesco Morosi, *Action, Song, and Poetry. Musical and Poetical Meta-performance in Aristophanes and Ben Jonon*, 2023 (pp. 169)
6. Micha Lazarus, *Leon Modena's Kinah Shemor*, 2023 (pp. 140)
7. Sonia Massai, 'The Operation of Individual Judgement': in Praise of *Critical Editing*. Shakespeare 1 - Serpieri Lectures 1, 2024 (pp. 116)